

# Medical History and Bioethics 558

Syllabus for Ethical Problems Raised by Biomedical Technology  
Spring 2006

Modified Apr 7, 2006; Complete

Instructors:	Phone	E-mail
Norman Fost, M. D., M. P. H.	263-8562	<a href="mailto:ncfost@wisc.edu">ncfost@wisc.edu</a>
Robert Streiffer, Ph.D.	263-9479	<a href="mailto:rstreiffer@facstaff.wisc.edu">rstreiffer@facstaff.wisc.edu</a>
Julie Fagan, M. D.	263-0150	<a href="mailto:jrfagan@facstaff.wisc.edu">jrfagan@facstaff.wisc.edu</a>
Justine Wells	263-2065	<a href="mailto:justinewells@wisc.edu">justinewells@wisc.edu</a>

**Organization:** This class meets Tuesdays from 11:00 – 12:15 for lectures, and on Thursdays at the times below for small group discussions. This is a survey course in bioethics, for advanced undergraduates and graduate students. Our goal is to familiarize students with the range of issues and arguments found in the literature of bioethics, and to encourage independent and critical thinking and writing on these topics.

Lecture: Tuesdays, 11:00 – 12:15, 270 Soils

Discussions: Thursdays

DIS 301	11:00 – 12:15	594 Van Hise	Wells
DIS 302	11:00 – 12:15	355 Van Hise	Fagan
DIS 303	9:30 – 10:45	474 Van Hise	Wells
DUS 304	4:00 – 5:15	123 Van Hise	Wells

Office Hours:

Streiffer 2:00 – 3:00, 5123 Helen C. White

**Reading:** The primary text for the course is *Ethical Issues in Modern Medicine*, by Bonnie Steinbock, John Arras, and Alex London (6<sup>th</sup> Edition, 2003). It is available at University Bookstore. Page numbers that follow are keyed to this book.

**Grading:** Students will be evaluated on the basis of weekly quizzes (20% total), based on the readings for that week; a 1200 – 1500 word (4 – 5 page) mid-term paper (30%), and a 2400 – 3000 word (8 – 10 page) final paper (50%). Attendance at lectures is required and can affect your grade. Put your name and discussion section on the first page of the paper, along with a final word count. Papers must be submitted either on disk or by e-mail attachment, but either a disk or printed copy must be delivered on the due date. The final grade can be raised or lowered by unusually constructive participation in discussion, or by an unusual lack of it. The mid-term paper is due at the beginning of class, Mar 9; the final paper at the beginning of class May 4.. Never turn in the only copy of your paper.

## Schedule:

1.	1/17	Introduction	Fost	1-41
----	------	--------------	------	------

- (a) Film: “Who Shall Survive
- (b) “Introduction: Moral Reasoning in the Medical Context”, 1 – 41

2.	1/24	Theory and Bioethics	Fost, Streiffer	
----	------	----------------------	-----------------	--

- (b) “Introduction: Moral Reasoning in the Medical Context”, 1 – 41

3.	1/31	Truth telling and Paternalism	Fost	56-66
----	------	-------------------------------	------	-------

- (a) “The Refutation of Medical Paternalism”, 56-64
- (b) “Beneficence Today, or Autonomy (Maybe) Tomorrow?”, 64
- (c) “Commentary” by Bernice S. Elger, 65 – 66
- (d) “Commentary” by Jean-Claude Chevrolet, 66
- (e) “Four Models of the Physician-Patient Relationship” by Ezekiel J. Emanuel and Linda L. Emanuel, 67-75
- (f) “Offering Truth” by Benjamin Freedman, 76 – 82

4.	2/7	Abortion	Streiffer	461-500
----	-----	----------	-----------	---------

- (a) “The Unspeakable Crime of Abortion” by Pope John Paul II, 461 - 462
- (b) “Why Abortion is Immoral” by Don Marquis, 463 – 470
- (c) “Why Most Abortions Are Not Wrong” by Bonnie Steinbock, 471-482
- (d) “A Defense of Abortion” by Judith Jarvis Thomson, 483 – 491
- (e) “The Morality of Abortion” by Margaret Olivia Little, 492 – 500

5.	2/14	Definition of Death	Fost	245-282
----	------	---------------------	------	---------

- (a) “Defining death,” 245-249
- (b) “The Definition of Death,” President’s Commission, 259-268
- (c) “The Impending Collapse of the Whole Brain Definition of Death,” Robert Veatch, 268-276
- (d) “How much of the brain must be dead?”, Baruch Brody, 277-282.
- (e) “Reconsidering the dead donor rule: Is it important that organ donors be dead?”, Fost N. Kennedy Institute of Ethics Journal 14(3):249-260, 2004 (available on website)

6.	2/21	Genetic Screening	Fost	501-570
----	------	-------------------	------	---------

- (a) “The Introduction of Cystic Fibrosis Carrier Screening into Clinical Practice: Policy Considerations” by Benjamin S. Wilfond and Norman Fost, 501 – 512
- (b) “Ethical Issues and Practical Problems in Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis, Jeffrey R. Botkin, 534-543
- (c) “Using Preimplantation Genetic Diagnosis to Save a Sibling,” Bonnie Steinbock, 544-545.

- (d) “Reproductive Freedom and Prevention of Genetically Transmitted Conditions,” Allen Buchanan, Dan W Brock, Norman Daniels, Daniel Wikler, 546-552 et al, 546-552
- (e) “Genetics and the Moral Mission of Health Insurance” by Thomas H Murray, 557-562
- (f) ”Patient Autonomy and Value Neutrality in Nondirective Counseling,” by Robert Wachbroit and David Wasserman 563-570

7.	2/28	Genetic Engineering	Fost	571-627
----	------	---------------------	------	---------

- (a) “The Presumptive Primacy of Procreative Liberty” by John Robertson, 595-604
- (b) “Instruction on Respect for Human Life in Its Origin and on the Dignity of Procreation”, by the Vatican, Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, 605-614
- (c) “Ethical Issues in Human Gene Transfer Research” by Eric T. Juengst and LeRoy Walters, 571-583”
- (d) “Germ-Line Gene Therapy: Ethically Acceptable in Principle” by LeRoy Walters and Julie Gage Palmer, 584-591”
- (e) “Germ-Line Gene Therapy: No Place in Treatment of Genetic Disease” by David M. Danls, 592-594”
- (e)“What is Wrong with Commodification” by Ruth Macklin, 615 – 624

8.	3/7	Consent	Robert Miller	83-106
----	-----	---------	---------------	--------

- (a) Arato v. Avedon, 83 - 90
- (b) “Antihypertensives and the Risk of Temporary Impotence: A Case Study in Informed Consent” by John D. Arras, 91
- (c) “Informed Consent—Must It Remain a Fairy Tale?” by Jay Katz, 92 – 99
- (d) “Transparency: Informed Consent in Primary Care” by Howard Brody, 100 – 106

\*\*\*\*\*March 14\*\*\*\*\*Spring Break\*\*\*\*\*

9.	3/21	Experimentation	Fost	705-721
----	------	-----------------	------	---------

- (a) “The Nuremburg Code”, 705
- (b) “The Jewish Chronic Disease Hospital Case” by Jay Katz, 706
- (c) “Rebuttal Affidavits for Respondent” by Chester M. Southam and Emanuel E. Mandel, 707 – 709
- (d) “How and by Whom Should the Consequences of Research Be Reviewed,” 710
- (e) “The Willowbrook Hepatitis Studies” by David J. Rothman and Sheila M. Rothman, 718 – 721
- (f) “The Willowbrook Hepatitis Studies Revisited,” Saul Krugman. 722-727.
- (g) “Racism and Research: The Case of the Tuskegee Syphilis Study.” Allan Brandt, 727-737.
- (h) “Tuskegee Re-Examined,” Richard Shweder. <http://www.spiked-online.com/sections/essays/index.htm> (Available on website)

10.	3/28	The Wisconsin Cystic Fibrosis Newborn Screening Study	Fost	
-----	------	---	------	--

- (a) Fost NC and Farrell PM. A Prospective randomized trial of early diagnosis and treatment of cystic fibrosis: a unique ethical dilemma. Clinical Research, 37(3):495-500, 1989. on e-reserve

11.	4/4	Foregoing Life-Sustaining Rx	Fagan	283-322; 333-340; 357-376
-----	-----	------------------------------	-------	---------------------------

- (a) State of Tennessee Department of Human Services v. Mary C. Northern, 283 - 286  
 (b) "Transcript of Proceedings: Testimony of Mary C. Northern" 287 - 289  
 (c) "Deciding for Others: Competency" by Allen Buchanan and Dan W. Brock, 290 - 300  
 (d) "A Chronicle: Dax's Case As It Happened" by Keith Burton, 301 - 304  
 (e) "Commentary" by Robert B. White, 305 - 306  
 (f) "Commentary" by H. Tristram Engelhardt, Jr. 307 - 308  
 (g) "The Living Will: Help or Hindrance?" by Stuart J. Eisendrath and Albert R. Jonsen, 309 - 315  
 (h) "The Health Care Proxy and the Living Will" by George J. Annas, 316 - 319  
 (i) "Testing the Limits of Prospective Autonomy: Five Scenarios" by Norman L. Cantor, 320 - 322  
 (i) "The Severely Demented, Minimally Functional Patient: An Ethical Analysis" by John D. Arras, 333-340  
 (j) "Quality of Life and Non-Treatment Decisions for Incompetent Patients: A Critique of the Orthodox Approach" by Rebecca S. Dresser and John A. Robertson, 357 - 367  
 (k) "The Limits of Legal Objectivity" by Nancy K. Rhoden, 368 - 376

12.	4/11	Foregoing Treatment Of Children: The Baby Doe Story	Fost	
-----	------	---	------	--

- a) Verhagen E, Sauer PJJ. The Groningen Protocol - Euthanasia in Severely Ill Newborns. *New Eng J Med* 352(10): 959-962, 2005 (Mar 10)  
 b) Burns JP, Mitchell CM. Is there any consensus about end of life care in pediatrics? *Archives of Pediatrics and Adol Medicine* 159:889-891, 2005 (Sep).  
 c) Fost N. Infant Care Review Committees in the Aftermath of Baby Doe. In: Caplan A, Blank R, Merrick J (eds.). *Compelled Compassion : Public Policy and the Care of Handicapped Newborns*. Humana Press, 1992.  
 d) Fost NC. Treatment of seriously ill and handicapped infants. In: Orłowski J (ed), *Ethical Moments in Critical Care Medicine*. Philadelphia, PA; WB Saunders, *Critical Care Clinics*, 2(1):149-159, January, 1986.

13.	4/18	Stem cells and cloning	Streiffer, Fost	631-682
-----	------	------------------------	-----------------	---------

- (a) "Cloning Human Beings: An Assessment of Ethical Issues Pro and Con" by Dan W. Brock, 631-642

- (b) “Preventing a Brave new World: Why We Should Ban Human Cloning Now” by Leon R. Kass, 643 – 655
- (c) “Human Cloning: Myths, Medical Benefits, and Constitutional Rights” by Mark D. Eibert, 656 – 664
- (d) “Even If It Worked, Cloning Wouldn’t Bring Her Back” by Thomas H. Murray, 665 – 667
- (e) “Respect for Human Embryos” by Bonnie Steinbock, 668 – 671
- (f) “Creating Embryos for Research: Weighing Symbolic Costs” by Maura A. Ryan, 672 – 682

14.	4/25	Markets in Health Care	Hausman	
-----	------	------------------------	---------	--

- (a) “Allocation, Social Justice, and Health Policy,” 145-152.
- (b) ”Uncertainty and the welfare Economics of medical Care,” by Kenneth Arrow. Only need to read through p. 954. (Available on the course website.)
- (c) “Health Care: Efficiency and Equity” by Dan Hausman. In *Ethical Dimensions of Geriatric Care*, edited by Spicker, Ingman, and Lawson, 67-78. (Available on the course website.)
- (d) “Health Care Reform: The Good, the Bad, and the Ugly,” by Michael Tanner. (Available on the course website.)

15.	5/2	Performance Enhancing Drugs	Fost	
-----	-----	-----------------------------	------	--

- (a) Norm Fost. “Banning drugs in sports: a skeptical view,” *Hastings Center Report*, August 1986, 5 – 10.
- (b) Norm Fost, “Stop the Hassle about Drugs,” *USA Today*, Sept. 16 – 18, 1988
- (c) Norm Fost, “Ben Johnson: The World’s Fastest Scapegoat,” *The New York Times*, Oct. 20, 1988
- (d) Norm Fost, “Let ‘em Take Steroids,” *The New York Times*, September 9, 1983.
- (e) Thomas Murray, “The Coercive Power of Drugs in Sports *Hastings Center Report*, August 1983, 24 – 30.